

# The Laws of Restitution

ROBERT STEVENS

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,  
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.  
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,  
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of  
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Robert Stevens 2023

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

First Edition published in 2023

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in  
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the  
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted  
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics  
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the  
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the  
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form  
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

Public sector information reproduced under Open Government Licence v3.0  
(<http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/doc/open-government-licence/open-government-licence.htm>)

Published in the United States of America by Oxford University Press  
198 Madison Avenue, New York, NY 10016, United States of America

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Data available

Library of Congress Control Number: 2022947801

ISBN 978-0-19-288502-9

DOI: 10.1093/oso/9780192885029.001.0001

Printed and bound by

CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and  
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials  
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

# Detailed Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxi
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xliv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xlix

## I. SUMMARY

1. Summary	3
A. Muscle Memory	3
B. Purposes	3
C. The Negative Thesis	4
1. History	4
2. 'Unjust Enrichment'	5
D. The Positive Thesis	9
1. The Dilemma	9
2. Unjustified Performance	9
3. Conditional Performance	10
4. Intervention in Another's Affairs	10
5. Property and Trusts	12
6. Wrongdoing	14
7. Countervailing Reasons	15
2. Foundations	16
A. Law and Justice	16
B. Corrective Justice	19
C. Reasons and Recourse	21
D. Legal Categories	22
E. Quasi-Contract	24

## II. UNJUSTIFIED PERFORMANCE

3. Performance	29
A. Introduction	29
B. Red Herrings	30
1. No Loss	30
2. No 'Unjust Factor'	31
3. Grudging Gifts	32
4. No Right Transfer	32
5. Incidental Benefits	34
6. No 'Transfers of Value'	35
C. Performance Defined	36
1. Summary	36
2. Action	38

3. Towards	42
4. Acceptance	46
D. Outside of Performance	50
1. Other Reasons	50
2. 'Interceptive Subtraction'	51
3. Errors	53
E. 'At the Expense of'?	55
4. Reversal	57
A. Enrichment?	57
B. Payments	58
1. Timing	58
2. Counterfactuals	59
3. Trustees and Agents	60
4. Increases in Value and Interest	62
C. Services	65
1. The Service and Its Consequences	65
2. Enrichment Higher than Market Value of Service	66
3. Enrichment Lower than Market Value of Service	67
D. The Meaning of Words	70
5. Theory	71
A. <i>Kelly v Solari</i>	71
B. The Role of Mistake and Similar 'Unjust Factors'	72
1. Summary	72
2. Negating	73
3. Nullifying	74
4. Voluntary Performance	76
C. What Is a Good Reason?	78
D. The Theory	79
1. The Operative Facts	79
2. Payments and Services	80
6. Practice	83
A. Introduction	83
B. Absence of Good Reason or Vitiating of Consent?	83
1. Rescission	83
2. Mistakes as to Recoverability	84
3. Obligations Performed	84
4. Gifts, Wills, and Trusts	89
5. Retrospective Changes	92
6. Corporate Mistakes	96
7. 'Spent' Mistakes	96
8. The 'Woolwich Principle'	98
9. The Invention of 'Unjust Factors'	100
10. Mispredictions	101
11. Different Causal Rules	102
C. Comparisons	103
D. Birks' Last Work	104

## III. CONDITIONAL PERFORMANCE

7. Conditions	109
A. A New Justification	109
B. Qualified Consent?	110
C. Outside of Contract	111
D. 'Total Failure of Consideration'	115
E. The Meaning of Condition	116
F. Waiver	120
G. The Fiction of Fulfilment	122
H. The Right or Its Performance?	123
I. Relevance of Termination	124
1. Terminology	124
2. Insufficient	125
3. Unnecessary	126
4. Relevance	127
8. Contract	128
A. Introduction	128
B. Breach of Contract	128
1. Claims for Restitution of Services by Party in Breach	128
2. Claims for Restitution of Payments Against Party in Breach	130
3. Claims for Restitution of Services Against Party in Breach	132
4. Claims for Restitution of Payments by Party in Breach	136
C. Frustration	137
1. Money Obligations	137
2. Non-money Obligations	142
3. Other Jurisdictions	146
D. Money, Services, and Penalties	147

## IV. INTERVENTION IN ANOTHER'S AFFAIRS

9. Discharge	153
A. The Significance of Discharge of Another's Obligation	153
B. Recoupment	154
C. Contribution	155
D. Methods of Discharge	157
1. Performance	157
2. Joint and Several Obligations	158
3. Conditional Obligations	159
4. Automatic Discharge?	160
E. Volunteers	161
F. Unjust Enrichment?	164
1. Enrichment Insufficient	164
2. Enrichment Unnecessary	167
3. Loss	168
4. The 'Unjust Factor'	169

10. Necessity	173
A. Good Samaritans and the Justification for Private Law	173
B. Quantification	176
C. The Law	177
1. Exceptions?	177
2. Discharge of Another's Obligation	178
3. Reciprocal Duties	178
4. Contribution Between Common Interests	181
5. Maritime Salvage	184
6. Necessaries supplied to Those Incapable of Contracting	187
D. Conclusion	187

## V. PROPERTY AND TRUSTS

11. Things	191
A. Introduction	191
B. Rights	191
C. Transfers	192
1. Contract and Conveyance	192
2. Delivery and Conveyance	197
D. Identification	198
1. Introduction	198
2. Mixtures	198
3. Accession	201
4. Specification	203
5. Fruits	205
E. Substitution	205
F. Good Faith Purchase for Value	209
G. Unjust Enrichment?	210
1. Relevance	210
2. Ignorance	211
3. Defences	211
4. Comparisons	213
12. Equity: General	214
A. Introduction	214
B. Meta-Law	215
C. 'Equitable Property Rights'	216
1. Rights to Rights	216
2. Common Misconceptions	219
3. Significance	220
4. The Necessary and Sufficient Duty to be a Trustee	222
D. Trusts Arising from Contractual and Other Obligations	224
13. Equity: Restitution	229
A. Trusts and Obligations to Make Restitution	229
B. Presumptions of Advancement and of Resulting Trust	235
C. Knowing Receipt of Trust Property	236
D. Purchase without Notice	241

E. 'Tracing'	243
1. Substitution	243
2. 'Mixing'	248
3. Wrongdoing	250
F. Subrogation	252
G. Policy?	256
H. Unjust Enrichment?	259
I. Doing without Equity?	262
14. Improvements	264
A. Introduction	264
B. Goods	264
1. <i>Greenwood v Bennett</i>	264
2. A Freestanding 'Enrichment' Claim?	264
3. A Qualification to a Damages Award	265
4. A Qualification to an Order for Specific Delivery	266
5. A Qualification to Accession?	266
6. A 'Tracing' Claim?	267
7. A Qualification to Priority of Title	267
C. Land	269
1. Introduction	269
2. Evidential Estoppel	269
3. Equitable Estoppel	270
4. Illegitimate Extension	276
5. Australia	285
6. The Future	287

## VI. WRONGDOING

15. Wrongs	291
A. Introduction	291
B. <i>Edwards v Lees Administrator</i>	291
C. Definitions and Distinctions	292
1. Wrongdoing	292
2. Consequential Loss and Wrongdoing	292
3. Consequential Gain and Wrongdoing	294
4. General and Special Damages	295
D. Justifications	297
1. The Obligation to Pay Damages	297
2. Disgorging Gains	299
E. The Wrong or the Right?	302
16. Profits	304
A. Introduction	304
B. Information	304
1. Intellectual Property Rights	304
2. Confidential Information	309
3. Private Information	311

C. Fiduciaries	313
1. Justification	313
2. Quantification	317
3. Constructive Trust?	318
4. Dishonest Assistance	318
D. Breach of Contract	320
1. General Principle	320
2. <i>Attorney General v Blake</i>	323
E. Torts	326
1. General Principle	326
2. Waiver of Tort	328
17. Damages	332
A. Introduction	332
B. Breach of Contract	332
1. <i>Wrotham Park Ltd v Parkside Homes Ltd</i>	332
2. General Damages: The Contractual Right to Performance	333
3. Negotiating Damages	338
C. Torts	344
1. General Damages	344
2. User Damages	346
3. Gain-based?	348

## VII. COUNTERVAILING REASONS

18. Defences	353
A. Introduction	353
B. Definitions	353
C. Specific Defences	354
1. Change of Position	354
2. Consent	369
3. Limitation	371
4. Passing on	374
5. Bona Fide Purchase	376
6. Counter-restitution	378
7. Bona Fide Payee?	385
8. Ministerial Receipt	385
19. Illegality	391
A. Justification	391
B. Defence, Denial, or Other?	392
C. Bribes	393
D. Reliance	395
E. Statutory Illegality	396
F. <i>Patel v Mirza</i>	401
1. The Statute	401
2. The Minority	402
3. The Majority	403



4. The <i>Ratio</i>	404
5. The Future	405
G. Summary	408
H. Illegality as a Ground of Claim	408
1. Restitution Founded upon the Statute	408
2. Withdrawal	409

VIII. APOLOGIA

20. Conclusion	415
A. Comparisons	415
B. 'Unjust Factors' or 'Absence of Basis'?	416
C. Like Contract, Torts, or Neither?	417
D. The Future	418
<i>Index</i>	421